



Republika ng Pilipinas

Lungsod Quezon

PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

Second Floor, Civic Center Building F, Quezon City Hall Complex, Elliptical Road, Quezon City
Tel. No. 8988-42-42 local 8709/8712



BAC RESOLUTION NO. 23-043

Series of 2023

A RESOLUTION ON THE RECOMMENDATION TO AWARD TO CARUNUNGAN & PARTNERS, CO. FOR THE CONSULTING SERVICES FOR THE DETAILED ARCHITECTURAL AND ENGINEERING DESIGN FOR THE PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION OF QUEZON CITY DISTRICT 6 LEVEL II HOSPITAL AT BARANGAY TANDANG SORA

WHEREAS, a Request for Expression of Interest was posted in the PHILGEPS, Quezon City website and at conspicuous places of Quezon City Hall Complex premises for the Public Bidding of the **CONSULTING SERVICES FOR THE DETAILED ARCHITECTURAL AND ENGINEERING DESIGN FOR THE PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION OF QUEZON CITY DISTRICT 6 LEVEL II HOSPITAL AT BARANGAY TANDANG SORA** with project number **CONSUL-23-004**;

WHEREAS, the Approved Budget Contract (ABC) is in the total amount of Fourteen Million Two Hundred Thousand Pesos Only (Php 14,200,000.00);

WHEREAS, four (4) prospective consultants responded to the Request for Expression of Interest and obtained eligibility documents within the scheduled issuance period, namely:

1. Asyana Construction Consultancy and Trading
2. Carunungan & Partners, Co.
3. Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates
4. A.C. Ong Consulting, Inc.

WHEREAS, the Bids and Awards Committee (BAC) conducted the opening of eligibility proposals of the prospective Consultants on September 21, 2023 for consulting services bidding pursuant to Section 24.4.1 Rule VIII of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184;

WHEREAS, the prospective Consultants' eligibility proposals had undergone the preliminary assessment and shortlisting process pursuant to Section 24.4.2 Rule VIII and Section 30.1 Rule IX of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184, the result of which are as follows:

| Name of Firm | Asyana Construction Consultancy and Trading | Carunungan & Partners, Co. | Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates | A.C. Ong Consulting, Inc. |
|---------------------------------|---|----------------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------|
| PARTICULARS | | | | |
| A. Eligibility Documents | | | | |
| Class "A" Documents | | | | |
| a. Philgeps Registration | Complied | Complied | Complied | Complied |
| b. SEC Registration | Complied | Complied | Complied | Complied |
| c. Mayor's Permit | Complied | Complied | Complied | Complied |
| d. Tax Clearance | Complied | Complied | Complied | Complied |
| e. Audited Financial Statement | Complied | Complied | Complied | Complied |
| | | | | |



Republika ng Pilipinas
Lungsod Quezon
PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

Second Floor, Civic Center Building F, Quezon City Hall Complex, Elliptical Road, Quezon City
 Tel. No. 8988-42-42 local 8709/8712



| | | | | |
|---|---|--------------|-------------|-------------|
| B. Technical Documents | | | | |
| Class "B" Documents | | | | |
| a. Statement of ongoing and completed projects including contracts awarded but not yet started, if any, whether similar or not similar in nature. | Complied | Complied | Complied | Complied |
| b. Statement of the consultant specifying its nationality and confirming that those who will actually perform the service are registered professionals. | Complied | Complied | Complied | Complied |
| Class "B" Documents | | | | |
| Joint Venture Agreement (JVA) | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| | | | | |
| C. Shortlisting Evaluation Process | | | | |
| a. Applicable Experience of the Consultant (50%) | 37 | 50 | 38 | 36 |
| b. Qualification of Personnel (30%) | 30 | 30 | 30 | 30 |
| c. Current Workload relative to capacity (20%) | 8 | 19 | 19 | 16 |
| | | | | |
| Total Score: 100 | 75% | 99.0% | 87% | 82% |
| | | | | |
| REMARKS: | Passed the min. Eligibility Score but not Shortlisted | Shortlisted | Shortlisted | Shortlisted |

WHEREAS, as required in the Eligibility Documents, shortlisted consultants must obtain a minimum passing score of 75% and the prospective consultants who will be entitled to submit bids shall not exceed to three (3).

WHEREAS, Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates, and A.C. Ong Consulting, Inc. obtained the first three (3) highest eligibility scores and passed the shortlisting process;

WHEREAS, the Technical Working Group (TWG) recommended to the Bids and Awards Committee (BAC) the qualifications of Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates, and A.C. Ong Consulting, Inc. in the shortlisting process for the Consulting Services for the Detailed Architectural and Engineering Design for the Proposed Construction of Quezon City District 6 Level II Hospital at Barangay Tandang Sora;

WHEREAS, the Bids and Awards Committee (BAC) confirms and approves the recommendation of the Technical Working Group (TWG) for the qualifications of Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates, and A.C. Ong Consulting, Inc. in the shortlisting process for the Consulting Services for the Detailed Architectural and Engineering Design for the Proposed Construction of Quezon City District 6 Level II Hospital at Barangay Tandang Sora;

WHEREAS, the Shortlisted consultants were notified for the submission of their technical proposals for the opening of bids held on October 18, 2023;



Republika ng Pilipinas

Lungsod Quezon

PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

Second Floor, Civic Center Building F, Quezon City Hall Complex, Elliptical Road, Quezon City
Tel. No. 8988-42-42 local 8709/8712



WHEREAS, during submission of bids only Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates submitted the proposal while A.C. Ong Consulting, Inc. did not;

WHEREAS, Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates complied with all the requirements subject for detailed technical evaluation;

WHEREAS, the TWG conducted the detailed evaluation on the technical bid proposal of Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates based on the following criteria as stated in the Terms of Reference (Quality-Cost Based Evaluation):

- 30% - Financial Proposal
- 70% - Technical Proposal
 - (50% - Quality of personnel to be assigned to the project)
 - (25% - Experience and capability of the consultant)
 - (25% - Plan of approach and Methodology)

WHEREAS, the shortlisted consultants must obtain a minimum technical score of 75%;

WHEREAS, the following are the results of the detailed evaluation on the technical proposal of Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates;

| Name of Bidders | Quality of personnel to be assigned to the project (50%) | Experience and capability of the consultant (25%) | Plan of approach and methodology (25%) | Total Score 100% | Remarks |
|----------------------------------|--|---|--|------------------|---|
| Carunungan & Partners, Co., | 50% | 25% | 23% | 98% | Passed the detailed evaluation on the technical proposal subject to further evaluation of financial component of bid proposal |
| Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates | 38% | 25% | 21% | 84% | Passed the detailed evaluation on the technical proposal subject to further evaluation of financial component of bid proposal |

WHEREAS, based on the results of the evaluation, Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates obtained passing scores of **98%**, and **84%**, respectively;

WHEREAS, the TWG recommended to the BAC for the opening of the financial proposal of Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates for the public bidding of the Consulting Services for the Detailed Architectural and Engineering Design for the Proposed Construction of Quezon City District 6 Level II Hospital at Barangay Tandang Sora for the purpose of completing the Quality-Cost based evaluation procedure for this consultancy services pursuant to Sec. 33.2.1 b) Rule IX of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184;



Republika ng Pilipinas
Lungsod Quezon
PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

Second Floor, Civic Center Building F, Quezon City Hall Complex, Elliptical Road, Quezon City
 Tel. No. 8988-42-42 local 8709/8712



WHEREAS, the BAC confirmed and approved the recommendation of the TWG for the opening of the financial proposal of Carunungan & Partners, Co., Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates for the public bidding of Consulting Services for the Detailed Architectural and Engineering Design for the Proposed Construction of Quezon City District 6 Level II Hospital at Barangay Tandang Sora for the purpose of completing the Quality-Cost based evaluation procedure for this consultancy services pursuant to Sec. 33.2.1 b) Rule IX of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184.

WHEREAS, the shortlisted Consultant’s financial proposals were opened on November 06, 2023 the result of which are as follows:

| Name of the Firm | Bid Amount |
|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Carunungan & Partners, Co., | Php 13,500,000.00 |
| Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates | Php 11,588,888.00 |

WHEREAS, as stated in the Terms of Reference for the bidding of this consultancy service, the bid proposals of the prospective Consultants shall be evaluated using the Quality-Cost Based Evaluation. The Technical proposal shall be given a weight of 70% whereas the financial proposal shall be given a weight of 30%

WHEREAS, the TWG computed the rating of each financial proposal in the following manner:

- a. The Firm/Consultant with the lowest bid price proposal gets 100 points; and
- b. The score of the other Firm/Consultant will be computed using the formula:

$$SF = 100 \times FI/F$$

Where:

SF = Financial Score

FI = Lowest Financial Proposal

F = Financial Proposal under consideration

| Name of the Firm | Financial Bid Proposal | Financial Score |
|----------------------------------|------------------------|---|
| Carunungan & Partners, Co., | Php 13,500,000.00 | 11,588,888.00/13,500,000.00= 85.84 pts. |
| Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates | Php 11,588,888.00 | 11,588,888.00/11,588,888.00= 100 pts. |

WHEREAS, in order to obtain the total score for the Technical and Financial Proposals of the Prospective Consultants the Technical Working Group (TWG) used the Formula $S = St \times T\% + Sf \times F\%$.

Where:

S = is the Total Score;

St = is the Technical Score;

Sf = is the Financial Score;

T = is the weight given to the Technical Proposal; and

F = is the weight given to the Financial Proposal.



Republika ng Pilipinas
Lungsod Quezon
PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

Second Floor, Civic Center Building F, Quezon City Hall Complex, Elliptical Road, Quezon City
Tel. No. 8988-42-42 local 8709/8712



WHEREAS, the Final computation of Score for the Technical and Bid Proposals of the prospective Consultants are as follows:

TECHNICAL PROPOSAL

| Firm | Average Score | | Weight | | Weighted Score |
|----------------------------------|----------------------|---|---------------|---|-----------------------|
| Carunungan & Partners, Co., | 98 | x | 70% | = | 68.6 |
| Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates | 84 | x | 70% | = | 58.8 |

FINANCIAL PROPOSAL

| Firm | Average Score | | Weight | | Weighted Score |
|----------------------------------|----------------------|---|---------------|---|-----------------------|
| Carunungan & Partners, Co., | 85.84 | x | 30% | = | 25.75 |
| Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates | 100 | x | 30% | = | 30 |

TOTAL TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL SCORE

| Firm | Technical Weighted Score | Financial Weighted Score | Total Weighted Score |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Carunungan & Partners, Co., | 68.6 | 25.75 | 94.35% |
| Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates | 58.8 | 30 | 88.8% |

WHEREAS, pursuant to Sections 33 Rule X of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184 the technical proposal and financial proposal submitted by Carunungan & Partners, Co., emerged as the Highest Rated Bid with a total rating/score of 94.35% while Oscar R. Ruivivar and Associates obtained a rating/score of 88.8%;

WHEREAS, the TWG recommended to the BAC to declare Carunungan & Partners, Co., as the Highest Rated Bid for the public bidding of the Consulting Services for the Detailed Architectural and Engineering Design for the Proposed Construction of Quezon City District 6 Level II Hospital at Barangay Tandang Sora;

WHEREAS, The TWG also recommended to the BAC to proceed with the negotiation with Carunungan & Partners, Co. (Highest Rated Bid) pursuant to Sec. 33.2.5 of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184 and to subject the said Consultant to post qualification process in accordance to Sec. 34, Rule X of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184;

WHEREAS, the Bids and Awards Committee) confirms and approves the recommendation of the Technical Working Group to Carunungan & Partners, Co. as the Highest Rated Bid for the public bidding of the Consulting Services for the Detailed Architectural and Engineering Design for the Proposed Construction of Quezon City District 6 Level II Hospital at Barangay Tandang Sora; **FURTHER**, the Bids and Awards Committee also approved and confirmed the recommendation of the Technical Working Group to proceed with the negotiation with Carunungan & Partners, Co. pursuant to Sec. 33.2.5 of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184 and to subject the said Consultant to post qualification process in accordance to Sec. 34, Rule X of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184;



Republika ng Pilipinas
Lungsod Quezon
PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

Second Floor, Civic Center Building F, Quezon City Hall Complex, Elliptical Road, Quezon City
Tel. No. 8988-42-42 local 8709/8712



WHEREAS, Arch. Michael Ventura, representative from the City Architect Department, requested for the omission of Permit to Construct issued by the Department of Health as part of the requirements under Project Components (Sec. III.A.3 It will be replaced by the submission of the Design Development Plans instead. Likewise, he also proposed for the omission of the submission of Plans and Certificate duly stamped by the DOH under item no. 10 of Sec. VIII. Deliverables. Moreover, Arch. Ventura, proposed for the following revisions on the Schedule of Payment, to wit;

| FROM | TO |
|--|---|
| 15% upon submission of Architectural Plans to DOH HFSRB for supplication of Pert To Construct based on the approved Schematic Architectural Plan through the City Health Department and the City Architect Department. | 15% upon Approval of Schematic Plans |
| 25% upon issuance of DOH Permit To Construct (PTC). | 25% upon submission of Design Development Plans |

WHEREAS, Ms. Carunungan, authorized representative of Carunungan & Partners, Co., noted the said revisions and stated that they are amenable and doesn't have any issues with it. The BAC confirmed and approved the revisions in the Terms of Reference as requested by Arch. Michael.

WHEREAS, as required under Sec. 34.2 Rule X of the Revised IRR of R.A. 9184, Carunungan & Partners, Co. submitted their latest income and business tax returns, and other appropriate licenses and permits required in the bidding documents;

WHEREAS, pursuant to Sec.34.3 Rule X of the Revised IRR of R.A. 9184, the Bids and Awards Committee through the Technical Working Group verified, validated and ascertained all statements made and documents submitted by Carunungan & Partners, Co. with the Highest Rated Bid, such as but not limited to, Legal, Technical and Financial requirements;

WHEREAS, pursuant to Sec. 34.4 Rule X of the Revised IRR of R.A. 9184, upon confirmation and ascertainment of the Technical, Legal and Financial capability of Carunungan & Partners, Co., to fulfill the obligation for Consulting Services for the Detailed Architectural and Engineering Design for the Proposed Construction of Quezon City District 6 Level II Hospital at Barangay Tandang Sora, the Bids and Awards Committee through the Technical Working Group to declare Carunungan & Partners, Co.as the Highest Rated and Responsive Bid (HRRB) and award the contract to Carunungan & Partners, Co. for the consultancy service being bid out;

WHEREFORE, the BAC, upon confirmation and ascertainment of the Technical, Legal and Financial capability of Carunungan & Partners, Co. to fulfill the obligation for Consulting Services for the Detailed Architectural and Engineering Design for the Proposed Construction of Quezon City District 6 Level II Hospital at Barangay Tandang Sora, confirms and approves the recommendation of the TWG to declare Carunungan & Partners, Co. as the Highest Rated and Responsive Bid (HRRB) for the consultancy service being bid out; **FURTHER**, the BAC also confirms and approves the recommendation of the TWG for the award of contract to Carunungan & Partners, Co. for the consultancy service being bid out;

FINALLY RESOLVED, the Bids and Awards Committee hereby recommends to the Head of the Procuring Entity (HOPE) to award the contract to Carunungan & Partners, Co. for the Consulting Services for the Detailed Architectural and Engineering Design for the Proposed Construction of Quezon City District 6 Level II Hospital at Barangay Tandang Sora.



Republika ng Pilipinas

Lungsod Quezon

PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

Second Floor, Civic Center Building F, Quezon City Hall Complex, Elliptical Road, Quezon City
Tel. No. 8988-42-42 local 8709/8712



BAC RESOLUTION NO. 23-043 A RESOLUTION ON THE RECOMMENDATION TO AWARD TO CARUNGAN & PARTNERS, CO. FOR THE CONSULTING SERVICES FOR THE DETAILED ARCHITECTURAL AND ENGINEERING DESIGN FOR THE PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION OF QUEZON CITY DISTRICT 6 LEVEL II HOSPITAL AT BARANGAY TANDANG SORA

Signed by the members of the Bids and Awards Committee (BAC) on Infrastructure and Consultancy Services this DEC 05 2023, at Quezon City.

| BAC MEMBERS | SIGNATURE |
|-------------------------------|-----------|
| ARCH. LUCILLE H. CHUA | |
| ATTY. SHERRY R. GONZALVO | |
| RAMON T. ASPRER | |
| MARIAN C. ORAYANI | |
| JUAN MANUEL J. GATMAITAN | |
| ENGR. ISAGANI R. VERSOZA, JR. | |

APPROVED BY:

HON. MA. JOSEFINA G. BELMONTE
City Mayor / Head of the Procuring Entity

